### **PERSPEKTIF**



Available online http://ojs.uma.ac.id/index.php/perspektif

# Moving Towards The Common Goal of Collaborative Governance in Indonesia Amid The Endemic Covid-19

#### Putra Anugerah Wibowo\* & Dian Suluh Kusuma Dewi

Government Science Study Program, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences Universitas Muhammadiyah Ponorogo, Indonesia

Submitted: April 17, 2023; Reviewed: June 18, 2023; Accepted: June 25, 2023

#### Abstract

This article aims to map the topics and issues of the Government of Indonesia's policies from the pandemic to the endemic of Covid-19. This study uses a qualitative approach. Data were obtained from literature such as online media and official government websites, laws and regulations and research journals related to Indonesian Government policies in the Covid-19 pandemic and then processed using the Nvivo 20 application. There were 251 articles reviewed and sourced from the Dimensions database. The data is processed using automatic coding and analyzed using the word cloud analysis and hierarchy chart features. The results of the study reveal that policies during the Covid-19 pandemic experienced easing. Policy easing is based on the declining results of Covid-19 cases and the increasingly controlled pandemic situation. The easing of this policy is that people are allowed homecoming, not wearing masks, domestic and foreign travellers with complete vaccines do not need to show antigen or PCR tests, face-to-face learning, and the lifting the Community Activity Restrictions (PPKM). The policies relaxed by the government are a transitional step from a pandemic to an endemic. Policy changes taken by the government require policy adaptation and coordination between governments at the central to regional levels.

Keywords: Public Policy; Government; Covid-19

**How to Cite**: Wibowo, P.A, & Dewi, D.S.K. (2023). Moving Towards The Common Goal of Collaborative Governance in Indonesia Amid The Endemic Covid-19. PERSPEKTIF, 12 (3): 992-1001.

\*Corresponding author:

ISSN 2085-0328 (Print)

E-mail: putraanuaerah294@amail.com

ISSN 2684-9305 (Online)



#### INTRODUCTION

In 2019, the world was shocked by an outbreak of pneumonia or inflammation of the lungs. The disease outbreak is characterized by fever, dry cough, tiredness and symptoms of digestive infection. This outbreak was first discovered in Hubei Province, China. The World Health Organization (WHO) named the disease Coronavirus 2 (SARS CoV-2) Covid-19. The covid-19 disease is caused by the SARS-CoV-2 virus, which causes severe acute respiratory symptoms. As of March 11 2022, the Covid-19 disease has spread to 114 countries with more than 118,000 positive confirmed cases and 400 deaths. With the rapid spread, the WHO declared this disease a pandemic (Firdaus, 2022). While Covid-19 cases spiked in China from December 2019 to February 2020, Indonesia reported no cases of Covid-19 at all. However, in April 2020, Indonesia confirmed the entry of the Covid-19 virus with 1790 cases; 170 died, and 112 recovered. (Djalante et al., 2020). On September 15 2021, the Government of Indonesia confirmed the number of people confirmed positive for Covid-19 totalling 4,178,164 people (Annisa, 2021). The Government claims the first peak of Covid-19 on July 15 2021, with 56,757 cases (Sabiila, 2022). Several countries in the world have considered implementing a policy of living with Covid-19. The journey from the pandemic phase to the endemic phase depends on the level or parameters of vaccination levels, immunity, transmission, and the emergence of new variants (Hong et al., 2022).



Figure 1. Development of the Covid-19 case in Indonesia
Source: (Infeksi Emerging, 2021)

The steps taken by the Government of Indonesia in dealing with Covid-19 are to tighten all activities carried out by the community and increase allocations to the health sector and social protection for people affected by Covid-19 (Putera et al., 2022). All examinations related to Covid-19, in terms of analysis, inpatient services, quarantine facilities and treatment, are entirely borne by the Government of Indonesia. For these funds, BPIS Health acts as a mediator and disburses funds from the Government to health facilities (Kesehatan et al., 2022). The Minister of Health of the Republic of Indonesia is working with the Coordinating Minister for Maritime Affairs and Investment, the Minister of Foreign Affairs and the Minister of BUMN to carry out several policies related to the Covid-19 vaccine and To achieve vaccination program. immunity against the Covid-19 Pandemic, the Government of Indonesia has set a vaccination program to be distributed to 208.27 million Indonesians (Martina, 2022). Vaccines will produce optimally virus-neutralizing antibodies to prevent Covid-19 disease and avoid unwanted effects. Several companies and research institutions have succeeded in developing a Covid-19 vaccine, which will be the hope for eradicating the Covid-19 virus. Indonesia is listed as the largest vaccineimplementing country that provides an average of 336 thousand doses per day or more than 18.5 million doses (Arifin & Anas, 2021).

People's mobility has improved with the revocation of the PPKM policy, eliminating antigen and PCR requirements, reducing the quarantine period, and the freedom to open masks in open spaces. Improved mobility can be seen in tourist attractions and public transportation facilities such as stations, terminals and wharves (Banowati & Dewi, 2022). The Indonesian Government is slowly starting to implement the transition from a pandemic to an endemic (EMedia DPR RI, 2022). During the transitional period, the Government of Indonesia made gradual and complete policy adjustments. The Government of Indonesia started by allowing the relaxation of community activities, and the Government agreed to use this time to restore the national economy, which had been hampered when the Pandemic came with the loosening of rules for travellers, both nationally and internationally. The Government will transition from Pandemic to endemic because it is felt that Covid-19 will not disappear soon (Citra Eka Putri & Hamzah, 2022). Of course, all policies towards endemic Covid-19 are not formulated alone; collaboration from all aspects is needed, namely experts, the media, community leaders, religious leaders, community organizations and the Government (Kemkes, 2022).

The Indonesian Government's policies towards the Covid-19 endemic are abolishing antigen and PCR requirements for domestic travel, revoking the quarantine policy for foreign travellers (PPLN) with negative results, reducing the maximum passenger limit on various public transportation facilities, and allowing spectators to attend sports matches (Sembiring, 2022). The PPKM policy was officially revoked on December 30 2022, after it was assessed that the pandemic situation was improving (Humas Kemensetneg, 2022). Problems in dealing with the Covid-19 Pandemic are problems to be faced together. Constitutionally, it is the duty and role of the Government to provide health protection services. All parties, be it the Government, nongovernmental organizations, NGOs, and the community, must collaborate to deal with the Covid-19 Pandemic (Juaningsih et al., 2020). The term collaboration is usually referred to as "Collaborative Governance" or collaborative Collaborative governance. Governance instruments include public institutions, nongovernmental private or actors, communities. Collaborative governance includes various aspects of planning, policymaking and management governance processes (Ansell & Gash, 2008). The results of previous studies, according to (Kim et al., 2022), Singapore's success in handling Covid-19 is due to collaboration between government agencies and various private parties that help prevent the public health system from being overwhelmed and ensure that people get proper maximum and health services sustainably. The research is located in Singapore using a comparative case study approach, namely analyzing content related to government documents, articles and academic journals. The research focuses on how the experience of the SARS outbreak has informed the Government's collaborative efforts with other stakeholders in society. This research will discuss Indonesia's collaborative governance to move towards a common goal amid the Covid19 Endemic, where the author aims to analyze how the Indonesian Government is moving from a pandemic to a Covid-19 endemic. This research is essential to analyze policies issued by the Government of Indonesia and contribute to developing knowledge in the field of government science.

#### **RESEARCH METHODS**

This study uses a qualitative approach to analyze the policies of the Government of Indonesia from the Pandemic to the endemic Covid-19. This article uses a literature review to examine the policy as a data collection technique. Reviewing policies with various focuses requires in-depth and cross-focus studies so that the division into two groups that conflict with each other in policies can be minimized (Wardhana, 2020). The object of discussion takes national policies, so data is taken from literature such as online media and official government websites, laws research journals related to Indonesian Government policies during the Covid-19 Pandemic. The data obtained is then processed using the Nyivo 20 application. The nyivo 20 application is software that can help process and understand qualitative data better and with certainty (Clarke et al., 2021).

#### **RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

The data obtained for analysis in the discussion amounted to 251 articles which were then re-selected into 49 scientific articles related to government policies from the Pandemic to endemic Covid-19. All of this data is processed using the Nvivo 20 software. Nvivo is an application that can import and organize files quickly, be it text files, audio, visuals, emails, or social media posts. Nvivo allows for the independent assignment of codes or according to coding schemes established by researchers (Clarke et al., 2021). The results of the Word Frequency Query in the processed data set display the themes that appear most frequently in the article. These words will give meaning to an issue that is the main topic discussed in the 49 articles.



Figure 2. Indonesian National Policy Dominant Issues Source: Nvivo 20

The frequency of the resulting words displays the words "covid", "government," "Indonesia", and "policy" which are the four highest words in discussing policy issues from Pandemic to endemic. This shows that all the articles processed have the same research focus. Several other words also focus on topics such as a vaccine, health, and implementation.

## Dynamics of government policies in dealing with the Covid-19 Pandemic

Almost all countries in the world are experiencing health and humanitarian crises caused by the Covid-19 Pandemic (Malik, 2022). Public policy is a solution to problems that arise in people's lives and forms of concrete action from the Government's ability to manage the country (Sulistiadi & Rahayu, 2020). Public policy does not necessarily exist without the intervention of the bureaucracy; on the other hand, public policy cannot be implemented without bureaucratic activity. Public policy is any choice the Government makes, whether to do something or not (Zahrotunnimah, 2021). The public policy contains matters relating to the administration of the state and the relationship between the state and its people. The Government aims to create public policies, namely for the welfare of a just society. Thus, public policy must prioritize ethics that place the public interest as the main objective. Public policy is the key to crisis management during the Covid-19 era (Illiyyina et al., 2021).

#### a) Issuing Policies

Various government bureaucratic efforts have been carried out by issuing policies intended as a first step to prevent the spread of Covid-19 (Zahrotunnimah, 2021). An example of a policy issued by several provincial and local governments as an anticipatory step is to close access to and from their respective territories, be it air, land or sea routes (Sukarno & Saleh, 2021). The policies that have been issued are official and consistent statements that do not create confusion between the central and regional levels (Sulistiadi & Rahayu, 2020).

#### b) 19 Handling Policy Network

The policy for handling Covid-19 in Lhokseumawe City has established a pattern of relations between policy actors. The level of the institutional network in handling policies for Covid-19 is already good, as can be seen from the formation of a team for handling Covid-19 from the city and sub-district to village levels so that it makes it easier to monitor the development of Covid-19. Policies are effective from an institutional standpoint. Actors in the policy institution for handling Covid-19 in Lhokseumawe have yet to fully follow the established rules of behaviour in acting, so there are still inconsistencies in the field (Utari et al., 2021).

#### c) Policy Implementation

Policy-making during an epidemic is complicated because of economic and political interests, actors and targets. So that the implementation of vulnerable policies becomes ineffective (Sulistiadi & Rahayu, Relations within the institution will determine what policy implementation is realized, what problems must be resolved, and what decisionmaking (Utari et al., 2021). Even though there were innovations at the start of Covid-19, the handling of them was relatively less successful due to inhibiting factors such as the Government being too confident underestimating the Covid-19 virus and the response of the public's indifference to government appeals in implementing policies but providing innovations in the field of health technology. Implementation of policies without clear priorities causes the rate of spread of Covid-19 to increase but on the other hand, there is a high level of concern to find solutions quickly. The success of policy implementation in detecting, preventing and responding to the

Covid-19 outbreak is determined by the health system's readiness (Aminullah & Erman, 2021).

#### Collaborative Governance; Regional Government, Local Government, Provincial Government

To overcome the problem of the Covid-19 Pandemic, the Government of Indonesia is collaborating with several parties, both the central Government, regional governments and other stakeholders (Wialdi et al., 2022). The increasing number of cases and deaths has forced the Government to take various steps to deal with the Covid-19 virus infection, starting from the central Government to the regions. Handling Covid-19 is a concurrent problem in which the Central Government and Regional Governments have authority and responsibility in dealing with the Covid-19 Pandemic. Thus, the Central and Regional governments work together to eradicate the Covid-19 Pandemic. Vaccination is one of the Central Government's measures to eliminate the Covid-19 Pandemic (Isril et al., 2021).

The Provincial Government is also responsible for distributing it to the regency and city areas (Isril et al., 2021). Several provincial and city governments have taken initiatives to control Covid-19. The provincial and city governments are the DKI Jakarta Government, the Solo City Government, the Central Java Provincial Government, and the West Java Provincial Government. The DKI Jakarta Provincial Government's initiative to control Covid-19 is to impose a ban on leaving Jakarta for three weeks. Likewise, the Central Government Iava Provincial practices canalization techniques and is informative and educative of the same understanding to the City Government and its staff. The Central Java Provincial Government also closed all activities including teaching and learning activities. tourist attractions, and providing education to the public regarding the prevention of transmission of Covid-19 (Zahrotunnimah, 2021). The regional/provincial Government of DKI Jakarta is firm in implementing the policy of Imposing Restrictions on Community Activities (PPKM) which is the most effective key in breaking the rate of virus transmission in the Jakarta area (Malik, 2022).

 Regional Government: policies have been issued but the level of citizen compliance is an obstacle. The high number of Covid-19 cases in Indonesia is thought to be caused by ineffective government policies. It can be seen that the Government's attitude needs to be faster in dealing with the spread of Covid-19 in Indonesia (Nugroho & Audinovic, 2022). Therefore, public compliance with policies issued by the Government to tackle Covid-19 tends to be low (Balkis et al., 2021). Government policy is not a straightforward decision of a single political principle but is an unstable and incomplete expression of the changing collective choice of political tenets (Agustino et al., 2021).

The process of handling Covid-19 carried out by the Government of Indonesia has yet to have the same understanding and has resulted in communication at the government level not going well. There is a lot of information being disseminated through government social media. The amount of data will affect the social cognition of society. As a result, the community will feel confused about determining the appropriate information to follow and in the end, the district will decide to ignore information from the Government (Roziqin et al., 2021).

#### b) Local government issues

The Padang City Government and other government organizations are anticipating the spread of Covid-19 with several preventive measures. The initial step was to form a task force and volunteers to prevent the spread of the Covid-19 virus by the Decree of the Mayor of Padang Number 149 of 2020 concerning the Task Force for the Acceleration of Handling Corona Disease in 2019. The regional Government of Padang City has the authority to prepare an operational plan for handling response. Covid-19 emergency in Padang City. The working group unit in handling Covid-19 consists of many related agencies. Coordination is carried out between the scope of government organizations and private parties implements good communication with stakeholders from the mass media group (Wialdi et al., 2022).

The Tangerang City Government's efforts in handling Covid-19 are by disseminating information on Covid-19 policies through online media, social media, and print media such as magazines, newspapers and other circulars. The Tangerang City Government's aim in disseminating programs and policies on

the Covid-19 Pandemic to the public is to carry out the process of bureaucratic information disclosure and accountability to the public so that public trust in the Government will also increase. Speed of information is needed in conveying the latest information both locally and nationally. This effort is carried out by the Government and is supported community and the accuracy of information targeting will produce genuine information and not become fake news. The people of Tangerang City are very enthusiastic and respond regarding the dissemination of information on the Covid-19 prevention policy carried out by the Tangerang City Government on social media. The community's enthusiasm can be seen from the community's participation in the Twitter account of the Tangerang City Government, which widely disseminates these tweets by the public (Satispi et al., 2021).

### Changes in pandemic policy to endemic by the Central Government

Over the past year, the Government of Indonesia has made changes and flexible policies related to the Covid-19 Pandemic. Modifications to these policies have been implemented by the Government slowly. Some of the policies that have begun to be changed are allowing the return of homecoming in 2022, loosening the use of masks in open spaces, domestic travellers and foreign travellers do not need to show antigen or PCR test results if they have complete vaccines, face-to-face learning, and most recently the Government Indonesia has officially revoked the Implementation of Restricting Community Activities (PPKM).

#### a) Homecoming was permitted in 2022

On April 14, 2022, President Joko Widodo announced that the Government had allowed the public to return to their homecoming trips. Before deciding on this policy, President Joko Widodo had held a limited meeting on homecoming preparations. The obtained were that the condition of the Covid-19 Pandemic in Indonesia was under control. Besides being allowed to return home, President Joko Widodo warned the public to remain vigilant so that there would be no spike in Covid-19 cases. The Government and its staff strict regulations regarding implementation of homecoming and are used as guidelines for people who do homecoming (Sekretariat Kabinet RI, 2022a).

#### b) He is not allowed to wear a mask.

The Indonesian Government has slowly loosened regulations in an effort to prevent the Covid-19 Pandemic. One of them is allowing people not to use masks in open areas. This decision was delivered directly by President Joko Widodo on May 17 2022, at the Bogor Presidential Palace (Kemensetneg, 2022). The easing of these rules is the first step to begin the transition from Pandemic to endemic. Communities are starting to understand how to live a healthy life so that a transition towards endemic can be carried out. Changes to the rules that are implemented are not necessarily without reason. Changes to the rules were made taking into account the Covid-19 situation. According to (Kementerian Kesehatan RI, 2022), cases of Covid-19 in Indonesia have decreased and Indonesian people already have good resistance to the virus. However, there are exceptions that require a person to wear a mask, namely people with vulnerable populations and those who have symptoms such as fever, cough and runny nose.

c) Domestic travellers (PPDN) and foreign travellers (PPLN) with complete vaccines do not need to show antigen or PCR tests.

According to Circular Letter Number 21 of 2022 concerning Provisions for Domestic Travel During the 2019 Corona Virus Disease (COVID-19) Pandemic, Domestic Travellers (PPDN) are people who travel from one region to another using land transportation, sea and air (Kementerian Luar Negeri RI, 2022). According to the Government, the condition and handling of Covid-19 in Indonesia continue to experience good results. These results can be seen from daily cases and deaths which continue to decrease. This is why the Government of Indonesia relaxed domestic or domestic travel regulations. In a video conference, the CoordinatingMinister for Maritime Affairs and Investment Luhut Binsar Panjaitan, said that domestic travellers who have received complete vaccinations do not need to show antigen or PCR results. Every policy issued by the Government is based on the results of the observations of experts and experts (Sekretariat Kabinet RI, 2022b).

Foreign Travelers (PPLN) are foreigners or Indonesian citizens travelling abroad. The

Government has announced regulations regarding foreign travel. Foreign travellers who have received the second or booster vaccines are allowed to continue their journey, which means they no longer need to show antigen and PCR results (Direktorat Promkes RI, 2022).

d) Face-to-face learning

On May 11 2022, four Indonesian Ministries, including the Minister of Education and Culture, Minister of Religion, Minister of Health, and Minister of Home Affairs, issued a Joint Decree concerning guidelines implementing learning during the Covid-19 Pandemic. The essence of the decree is that the Government is ready to carry out one hundred per cent face-to-face learning with the condition that the vaccination of educators and education staff reaches 80 per cent and above and the elderly are 60 per cent above. For those in the PPKM level 4 area, face-to-face learning can only be carried out 50 per cent, and distance learning can also be carried out (Kemdikbud RI, 2022).

e) Repeal of the Enforcement of Community Activity Restrictions (PPKM)

On December 30 2022, President Joko Widodo, accompanied by Minister of Home Affairs Tito Karnavian and Minister of Health Budi Gunadi Sadikin, announced that the PPKM policy had been officially revoked. This decision was based on controlling the Covid-19 Pandemic, which is under good control. The number of cases of the Covid-19 Pandemic in Indonesia in recent months has been below WHO standards. Indonesia has managed to control the Covid-19 Pandemic well through implemented policies (Kemensetneg RI, 2022). The repeal of PPKM is a process for the Government of Indonesia to carry out a transitional period towards endemic. The Minister of Home Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia has issued Minister of Home Affairs Instruction Number 53 of 2022. The instruction contains the termination of PPKM and control of Covid-19 during the transition period towards endemic (Satgas Covid-19, 2022).

#### CONCLUSION

At the beginning of the Covid-19 Pandemic, Indonesia experienced a spike in Covid-19 cases, which were predominantly high. The Indonesian Government is trying to control the Covid-19 case by implementing various policies. The Government is tightening

all activities carried out by the community and increasing allocations to the health sector and social protection for the community. Central governments collaborate and local cooperate in implementing policies. Indonesian Government succeeded implementing a vaccination program that created herd immunity in the formed community. The formation of group immunity makes people more immune to the Covid-19 virus. Over time, policies during the Covid-19 Pandemic experienced easing. Policy easing is based on the results of Covid-19 cases, which continue to decline, and the pandemic situation is increasingly under control. The easing of this policy includes allowing homecoming to return in 2022; people may not use masks in open spaces; Domestic Travelers (PPDN) and Foreign Travelers (PPLN) with complete vaccines do not need to show antigen or PCR tests; re-implementation of face-to-face learning, as well as the repeal of the Enforcement of Community Activity Restrictions (PPKM). The policies relaxed by the Government are a step in the transition period from the Pandemic to the endemic. In implementing policies, the Government only sometimes runs smoothly. The Government needed to be considered faster in handling the Covid-19 Pandemic in the community.

#### REFERENCES

Agustino, L., Sylviana, M., & Budiati, A. (2021).
Government Capacity in Coping with Covid19 in Bandung City. *Jurnal Borneo Administrator*, 17(3), 275–290.
https://doi.org/10.24258/jba.v17i3.847

Aminullah, E., & Erman, E. (2021). Policy innovation and emergence of innovative health technology: The system dynamics modelling of early COVID-19 handling in Indonesia. *Technology in Society*, 66. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.techsoc.2021.101

Annisa, D. (2021, September). Situasi Terkini Perkembangan Coronavirus Disease (COVID-19) 16 September 2021. Infeksi Emerging. https://infeksiemerging.kemkes.go.id/situasi-infeksi-emerging/situasi-terkiniperkembangan-coronavirus-disease-covid-19-16-september-2021

Ansell, C., & Gash, A. (2008). Collaborative governance in theory and practice. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*, 18(4), 543–571. https://doi.org/10.1093/jopart/mum032